

Hemixus sumatranus Wardlaw Ramsay, 1882, and Hemixus sumatranus Salvadori, 1888

Authors: Aimassi, Giorgio, and Dickinson, Edward C.

Source: Bulletin of the British Ornithologists' Club, 138(2) : 135-139

Published By: British Ornithologists' Club

URL: <https://doi.org/10.25226/bboc.v138i2.2018.a8>

The BioOne Digital Library (<https://bioone.org/>) provides worldwide distribution for more than 580 journals and eBooks from BioOne's community of over 150 nonprofit societies, research institutions, and university presses in the biological, ecological, and environmental sciences. The BioOne Digital Library encompasses the flagship aggregation BioOne Complete (<https://bioone.org/subscribe>), the BioOne Complete Archive (<https://bioone.org/archive>), and the BioOne eBooks program offerings ESA eBook Collection (<https://bioone.org/esa-ebooks>) and CSIRO Publishing BioSelect Collection (<https://bioone.org/csiro-ebooks>).

Your use of this PDF, the BioOne Digital Library, and all posted and associated content indicates your acceptance of BioOne's Terms of Use, available at www.bioone.org/terms-of-use.

Usage of BioOne Digital Library content is strictly limited to personal, educational, and non-commercial use. Commercial inquiries or rights and permissions requests should be directed to the individual publisher as copyright holder.

BioOne is an innovative nonprofit that sees sustainable scholarly publishing as an inherently collaborative enterprise connecting authors, nonprofit publishers, academic institutions, research libraries, and research funders in the common goal of maximizing access to critical research.

Hemixus sumatranus Wardlaw Ramsay, 1882, and *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori, 1888

by Giorgio Aimassi & Edward C. Dickinson

Received 3 March 2018; revised 17 May 2018; published 22 June 2018

<http://zoobank.org/urn:lsid:zoobank.org:pub:5394C58B-0B55-4966-A3AF-3C02F52BD96A>

SUMMARY.—Eight specimens collected in 1878 by the Italian explorer Odoardo Beccari have provided one or more type specimens for two seemingly identical names given to the Sunda Bulbul of Sumatra, now treated as a subspecies of *Ixos virescens* or perhaps a full species. These names are *Hemixus sumatranus* Wardlaw Ramsay, 1882, and *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori, 1888. The *International code of zoological nomenclature* is not clearly explicit on the treatment of a name that when introduced was simultaneously a junior homonym and an objective junior synonym. While both names are available, the junior one is invalid because of its homonymy. Because both names are available, both have type material and this is not identical. Here we clarify the situation and the type material applicable.

This case came to light during research relating to the type specimens of the ornithological collection of the Univ. of Turin (MZUT), Italy, held in the Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali (MRSN). It had already been noted by Dickinson *et al.* (2002) and in a footnote on p. 132 these authors wrote that ‘Salvadori was apparently unaware of the name proposed by Wardlaw Ramsay’. They listed Salvadori’s name as a junior synonym, believing it to be based on separate type material. More likely he became aware of it only four or five years later. It seems probable that Wardlaw Ramsay never sent Salvadori an offprint, and we suggest that this was because Wardlaw Ramsay’s uncle, the Marquis of Tweeddale, died in 1878 and Wardlaw Ramsay was commissioned to prepare the collected papers of his uncle for publication, a task he completed in 1881.

The specimens involved

Wardlaw Ramsay’s name.—Warren & Harrison (1971: 544) listed BMNH (now NHMUK) 1888.4.1.305 as the holotype of *Hemixus sumatranus* Wardlaw Ramsay, 1882. The original description dealt with a specimen that had come from Count Salvadori ‘in a small lot of duplicates of M. Beccari’s collection’. Wardlaw Ramsay appears to have assumed that he had discovered the one specimen that existed of his new species, probably aided in this idea by the fact that Salvadori’s notes would appear to have classified it as *Hypsipetes malaccensis*. Reference to the new taxon appeared in *Ibis* in the following year, in a paper concerning the birds of Sumatra (Nicholson 1883: 246) which one might have supposed that Salvadori would see. Indeed, it is possible that Count Salvadori was sent an offprint but it did not reach him, although Wardlaw Ramsay’s preoccupation, mentioned above, may suggest one was not sent.

Salvadori’s name.—Salvadori (1879: 221), in the catalogue of Sumatran birds collected by Odoardo Beccari, listed eight specimens obtained on Mount Singalan in 1878, between 28 June and 18 July (or perhaps 9 August), identifying them as *Hypsipetes malaccensis* Blyth, 1845. As discussed above, one of these specimens, no. 62 of the Beccari collection, was sent in a lot of duplicates to R. G. Wardlaw Ramsay, whose description of this is mentioned

above. A few years later Salvadori (1888)¹, seemingly unaware of the name proposed by Wardlaw Ramsay, realised that the specimens collected by Beccari did not belong to *Hypsipetes malaccensis* and described his 'new species' *Hemixus sumatranus*.

Salvadori, recalling the 1879 paper, reiterated that there were five males, two females and one unsexed bird, but he did not remark on the fact that one or more of the eight specimens was no longer in the collection. It is probable that Salvadori did not revisit the eight specimens collected by Beccari. However, the reference in the 1888 paper is completely explicit and there is no doubt that all of the specimens listed in 1879 as *Hypsipetes malaccensis* become syntypes of *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori, 1888 (but not of Wardlaw Ramsay's name), and that the specimen sent to Wardlaw Ramsay, his holotype, must be counted as one of them.

As reported by Salvadori (1916: 29) and by Elter (1986: 240), in the MZUT collection there is a type specimen of *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori (Fig. 1), which was donated by Marquis Giacomo Doria in 1878, along with another 19 specimens collected by O. Beccari on Sumatra, probably to reward Salvadori for having studied the entire collection. Arbocco *et al.* (1979: 212) reported the presence of three syntypes of *H. sumatranus* Salvadori in the Museo Civico di Storia Naturale "Giacomo Doria", Genova (MSNG), the basis for listing the Genoa Museum by Dickinson *et al.* (2002). The sixth specimen collected on Sumatra by Dr Beccari for which we have information is no. 129, collected 11 July 1878. According to the SysTax database (<http://www.systax.org>, accessed 9 November 2017) it is located at the Senckenberg Naturmuseum, Frankfurt-am-Main, and referred to as a 'typus' of *Hemixus sumatranus* Ramsay.

The subsequent literature

Salvadori's *Hemixus sumatranus* was mentioned in *Ibis* under 'Recently published ornithological works' (Anon. 1888: 368). A few years later, Oberholser (1899: 212–213), listing all the species of the genus *Ixos*, which in his opinion 'must supplant *Hemixus* Hodgson', quoted '*Ixos sumatranus* (Salvadori)' and made no reference to the binomen introduced six years earlier by Wardlaw Ramsay.

Büttikofer (1900: 226–228) appears to have been the first author to mention both Wardlaw Ramsay and Salvadori's names. He was obviously aware that the specimens described came from the same locality, but he considered both names to be junior synonyms of *Hemixus malaccensis* Blyth and did not refer either to their types or to their homonymy. Chasen (1935: 192) considered *Ixos sumatranus* (Wardlow [*sic*] Ramsay) to be a valid subspecies of *Ixos virescens* Temminck, 1825, but did not refer to Salvadori's description.

H. G. Deignan (*in* Mayr & Greenway 1960: 291–292) continued to consider *H. sumatranus* Wardlaw Ramsay as a valid subspecies of *Ixos virescens*, as did Dickinson *et al.* (2002: 132) noting synonymy with *H. sumatranus* Salvadori.

No author has previously clarified that Wardlaw Ramsay's holotype must be a syntype of Salvadori's name. The issue we address here is whether the two names (one being both a junior homonym and a junior synonym) are both validly introduced. That the earlier name is validly introduced has not been challenged, nor do we see any basis for challenging it. So, we focus here on the status of Salvadori's name.

The term 'homonym', whether primary or secondary, is defined explicitly to apply to names with the same spelling established for different nominal taxa (ICZN 1999, Art. 57.2 and 57.3). The *Code* makes clear that a junior primary homonym is—except in exceptional

¹ The work of Salvadori is usually dated to 1887, but it was actually published on 2 January 1888 (Poggi 2010: 345).



Figure 1. Syntype of *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori and two old labels, showing original identification as *Hypsipetes malaccensis* Blyth (above) and subsequent designation as 'type' of *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori (below), Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali di Torino (MZUT Av9563) (L. Ghiraldi, © MRSN)

circumstances—permanently invalid (Art. 57.2). Note that the Glossary of the *Code* defines 'invalid' as meaning 'Of an available name or nomenclatural act...' (ICZN 1999: 107). So, published in accord with the rules in the *Code*, a name can be available—as Salvadori's name is—but invalid.

A few other examples of homonyms that are also junior synonyms come to mind: see for example (1) *Pitta ussheri* Gould, 1877, and of Sharpe, 1877 (Dickinson *et al.* 2000: 104); (2) *Melanocorypha maxima* Blyth, 1867, and of Gould, 1867 (Dickinson *et al.* 2001: 89, 100); (3) *Alauda tenuirostris* C. L. Brehm, 1841, and of d'Orbigny & Lafresnaye, 1836 (Dickinson & Lebossé 2018: 164). In addition, during GA's examination of type specimens in the ornithological collection of the MRSN, Turin, the case of *Sylvia cetti* Temminck, 1820, and *Sylvia cetti* Marmora, 1820, was noticed and the issue of precedence in that case needs to be addressed.

The status of the type specimens linked to Salvadori's name

We consider that *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori was published and is available, but it is invalid because it is a junior homonym. However, as an available name it is entitled to types. Based on that availability, the syntypes of *Hemixus sumatranus* Salvadori, 1888, all collected in 1878 on or near Mount Singalan, West Sumatra, are listed below:

Beccari no. 62, captured 28 June, is in Tring museum with the reg. no. NHMUK 1888.4.1.305, and is referred to as the holotype of *Hemixus sumatranus* Wardlaw Ramsay (Warren & Harrison 1971: 544). The museum's type catalogue may need editing to record this as a syntype of Salvadori's name.

No. 106 of the Beccari collection, captured 9 July (but the original label shows the date 9 August), corresponds to specimen MZUT Av9563 of the Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali, Torino.

Beccari no. 146, ♂ captured 15 July, no. 116, ♂ captured 10 July, no. 147, ♀ captured 15 July, correspond to specimens C.E. 9349, 9350 and 9351, respectively, of the Museo Civico di Storia Naturale "Giacomo Doria", Genova (Arbocco *et al.* 1979).

Beccari no. 129, ♂ captured 11 July, is in the Senckenberg Naturmuseum, Frankfurt-am-Main, with the no. SMF-50783 and (erroneously) referred to as a 'typus' of *Hemixus sumatranus* Wardlaw Ramsay (SysTax database; G. Mayr pers. comm.). Actually, this specimen is a syntype of *H. sumatranus* Salvadori.

The location of Beccari specimens no. 123, ♂ collected 11 July, and no. 164, ♀ collected 18 July, is not known.

Acknowledgements

For their collaboration in the preparation of this note, we are very grateful to Elena Gavetti, Luca Ghiraldi, Claudio Pulcher, Marina Spini (Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali, Torino, Italy), Mark Adams (Natural History Museum, Tring, UK), Gerald Mayr (Senckenberg Naturmuseum, Frankfurt-am-Main, Germany), and Frank Rheindt (National University of Singapore, Singapore). We also thank the referees, Andrew Elliott and Frank Steinheimer, for their helpful comments.

References:

- Anon. 1888. Recently published ornithological works. 76. Salvadori on a new *Hemixus*. *Ibis* 30: 368.
- Arbocco, G., Capocaccia, L. & Violani, C. 1979. Catalogo dei tipi di uccelli del Museo Civico di Storia Naturale di Genova. *Ann. Mus. Civico Storia Nat. Genova* 82: 184–265.
- Büttikofer, J. 1900. Zoological results of the Dutch scientific expedition to central Borneo. The birds. *Notes Leyden Mus.* 21: 145–276.
- Chasen, F. N. 1935. A handlist of Malaysian birds. *Bull. Raffles Mus., Singapore, Straits Settlements* 11: 1–389.
- Dickinson, E. C. & Lebossé, A. 2018. A study of d'Orbigny's "Voyage dans l'Amérique Méridionale". IV. New avian names deriving from d'Orbigny's expedition with evidence for their first introduction and necessary corrections to authorship, dates and citations. *Zool. Biblio.* 5(4): 49–274.
- Dickinson, E. C., Dekker, R. W. R. J., Eck, S. & Somadikarta, S. 2000. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 5. Types of the Pittidae. *Zool. Verhand. Leiden* 331: 101–119.
- Dickinson, E. C., Dekker, R. W. R. J., Eck, S. & Somadikarta, S. 2001. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 12. Types of the Alaudidae. *Zool. Verhand. Leiden* 335: 85–126.
- Dickinson, E. C., Dekker, R. W. R. J., Eck, S. & Somadikarta, S. 2002. Systematic notes on Asian birds. 26. Types of the Pycnonotidae. *Zool. Verhand. Leiden* 340: 115–160.
- Elter, O. 1986. *La collezione ornitologica del Museo di Zoologia dell'Università di Torino*. Cataloghi 8. Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali, Torino.
- International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature (ICZN). 1999. *International code of zoological nomenclature*. Fourth edn. The International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London.
- Mayr, E. & Greenway, J. C. (eds.) 1960. *Check-list of birds of the world*, vol. 9. Mus. Comp. Zool., Cambridge, MA.
- Nicholson, F. 1883. On a second collection of birds made in the island of Sumatra by Mr. H. O. Forbes. *Ibis* 25: 235–257.
- Oberholser, H. C. 1899. Some untenable names in ornithology. *Proc. Acad. Nat. Sci. Philadelphia* 51: 201–216.

- Poggi, R. 2010. Gli "Annali" pubblicati dal Museo civico di Storia naturale "Giacomo Doria" di Genova: storia del periodico ed indici generali dei primi cento volumi (1870-2009). *Ann. Mus. Civico Storia Nat. "Giacomo Doria"* 101: 1–529.
- Salvadori, T. 1879. Catalogo di una collezione di uccelli fatta nella parte occidentale di Sumatra dal Prof. Odoardo Beccari. *Ann. Mus. Civico Storia Nat. Genova* 14: 169–253.
- Salvadori, T. 1888. Descrizione di una nuova specie del genere *Hemixus* raccolta in Sumatra dal Dott. O. Beccari. *Ann. Mus. Civico Storia Nat. Genova* 25: 525–527.
- Salvadori, T. 1916. Notizie storiche intorno alla collezione ornitologica del Museo di Torino. *Mem. R. Accad. Sci. Torino* (2)65: 1–49.
- Wardlaw Ramsay, R. G. 1882. Descriptions of two new species of birds from Sumatra. *Ann. Mag. Nat. Hist.* (5)10: 431.
- Warren, R. L. M. & Harrison, C. J. O. 1971. *Type-specimens of birds in the British Museum (Natural History)*, vol. 2. Trustees of the Brit. Mus., London.
- Addresses:* Giorgio Aimassi, c/o Museo Regionale di Scienze Naturali, Turin, Italy, e-mail: gaimass@tin.it.
Edward C. Dickinson, 19 Marlborough Court, Southfields Road, Eastbourne BN21 1BT, UK, e-mail: edward@asiaorn.org